

**MINUTES**  
**ALABAMA REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD**  
**RSA UNION STREET**  
**SUITE 370**  
**MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA**  
**November 18, 2005**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Mr. Mandell Tillman (Chairman)  
Mr. Clifford Odom  
Mr. James Davis (Vice-Chairman)  
Mr. Leston Stallworth  
Mr. Jon B. Blissitte  
Mr. Steve Martin  
Mr. Thomas E. Garrett

**MEMBERS ABSENT:**

Mr. Otis Stewart, Jr.  
Mrs. Myra Pruitt

**OTHERS PRESENT:**

Mrs. Lisa Brooks  
Ms. Neva Conway  
Mr. D.J. Dixon  
Mrs. Carolyn Greene

- 1.0           With quorum present Mr. Tillman, Chairman called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. The meeting was held at the RSA Union Building, 100 N. Union Street, 3rd Floor Conference Room, Montgomery, Alabama.
  
- 1.1           The meeting was opened with prayer by Mr. Martin and then the Pledge of Allegiance.
  
- 2.0           Members present were Mr. Mandell Tillman, Mr. James Davis, Mr. Clifford Odom, Mr. Leston Stallworth, Mr. Steve Martin, Mr. Jon B. Blissitte and Mr. Thomas E. Garrett. Members absent were Mrs. Myra Pruitt and Mr. Otis Stewart, Jr.
  
- 3.0           On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Davis the regular minutes for September 23, 2005 were approved as written. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 3.2 Ms. Conway included in the Board books a letter from Mr. Ward Edge requesting additional time to complete education required in the Consent Settlement Order for AB-05-09 due to difficulty in scheduling the remaining courses. On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Blissitte, the Board voted to grant Mr. Ward a continuation until the first time the courses are again offered. Ms. Conway is to check on course availability and notify Mr. Ward. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Ms. Conway also included in the Board books for information purposes the Notice of Appeal and Petition for Judicial Review filed by Ray Brannum in the circuit court of Marshall County. Ms. Conway will inform the Disciplinary Committee if there are any changes.

- 4.0 Ms. Conway informed the Board that we would ask that our Bill be pre-filed for introduction into the Regular Session. We are asking that Senator Means sponsor our Bill in the Senate and Rep. Ronald Grantland to sponsor in the House. Ms. Conway also informed the Board that the Bill has already been submitted to the Sen. Means and Rep. Grantland. They will have to get the Bill to Legislative Reference.

Mr. Greg Albritton informed the Board of legislation he is introducing regarding ad valorem reappraisals. Mr. Albritton will give Board members copies of this legislation.

There will be no reconsideration hearings held during the January 2006 Board meeting due to holding a Public Hearing on Administrative Rule 780-X-9.

After making a few changes to the Proposed Trainee/Mentor Policy the Board gave Ms. Conway the approval to send the changes to Legislative Reference.

- 5.0 On motion by Mr. Odom and second by Mr. Stallworth the following applications were voted on as listed. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 5.1 **Trainee Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Robert F. Alexander, Jr., Jerry J. Anderson, III, Joshua N. Davies, Ryan W. Dean, Thomas D. Dermody, Curtis L. Grissom, Melissa L. Halsey, George Anna Harris, Larry R. Hillard, Andrew G. Lowrey, Kellie J. Ross, Jeffery P. Zielke.

- 5.2      **State Registered Real Property Appraiser application deferred:**  
Douglas G. Hicks.
- 5.3      **Licensed Real Property Appraiser applications approved:**  
Andre' E. Brown (Recip.)(GA), William P. McFarland, Camille B. Posey, Darrell S. Willeford, James B. Wood (Recip.)(GA).  
**Applications deferred:** Nancy M. Case, Jim Dennis, Dennis L. Kern
- 5.4      **Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser applications approved:** Fred N. Acker, Robert J. Andrews, Rita Baileys (Recip.)(GA), Samuel L. Craft (Recip.)(MS), Richard D. Hyatt (Recip.)(TN), Jennifer O. Petty, Charles A. Raymer (Recip.)(GA), Robyn B. Sartin, Darla Sasser. **Applications deferred:** Ethan Couch, Gregory S. Dalton, David M. Hayes, William F. Nixon, Melissa A. Pugh.
- 5.5      **Certified General Real Property Appraiser application approved:** Donald S. Armstrong, Edward P. Karabedian (Recip.)(GA), Joseph S. Key (Recip.)(TN), Peter A. Lamas (Recip.)(GA), Chris Lantz (Recip.)(TX), Rudolph R. Robinson, III (Recip.)(TX), Hayden L. Scott, Robert B. Tomlin, Robert W. White (Recip.)(VA). **Applications deferred:** Joseph W. Gattozzi, George M. Shanahan.
- 6.0      Mrs. Brooks discussed the financial report with the Board. Mrs. Brooks stated we were 8% into FY 06 and 9% into budget expenditures. Mrs. Brooks stated there were no negative trends that could not be reconciled at this time. On motion by Mr. Blissitte and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to approve the Financial Report. Motion carried by unanimous vote.
- 6.1      On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Odom the following education courses and instructor recommendations were approved, deferred, or denied as indicated:

### **APPRAISAL INSTITUTE - CHICAGO**

#### **Initial Application:**

(CE) FHA and the New Residential Appraisal Forms – 7 Hours –  
Traditional Classroom

(Instructor: Roger Beale)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

## **SHELTON STATE COMMUNITY COLLEGE**

### **Initial Application:**

(CE) Square Footage – Method for Calculating: ANSI – Z765-2003 – 4 Hours – Traditional Classroom  
(Instructor: Richard Laframboise)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

### **Initial Application:**

(CE) Understanding a Home Inspection Report – 3 Hours – Traditional Classroom  
(Instructor: Richard Laframboise)

**Course and Instructor Approved**

### **Initial Application:**

(CE) Moisture Intrusion, Progression of Damages & Valuation – 7 Hours – Traditional Classroom  
(Instructor: Richard Laframboise)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

## **WORLDWIDE ERC**

### **Initial Application:**

(CE) The Relocation Appraisal Training Program – 6 Hours – On-Line  
(Instructor: Jay K. Delich)

**Both Course and Instructor Approved**

Motion carried by unanimous vote.

A memo to Mr. Odom and the members of the Education Committee from Mr. Dixon outlining some suggestions regarding education was included in the Board books for Board information.

A copy of a letter from Mr. Dennis Greene to Mrs. Sandy Guilfoil, AQB Chairman regarding 7 hour USPAP update requirement was included for Board information.

An e-mail from Mr. Kirk Epstein to Governor Riley's daughter was included for Board information.

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that Trainee Orientations would resume the first part of the New Year. Mr. Odom suggested that the USPAP portion of the Trainee Orientation be re-written.

At this time Mr. Odom gave the Education Committee Report. He suggested at some point hiring a third investigator who would be an education coordinator.

Mr. Davis asked the Education Committee to research the option of our Board giving instructor training sessions in the future. The Education Committee will discuss and report at our March 2006 meeting.

### **RECONSIDERATION HEARINGS**

Mr. Gregory Albritton was present to represent Mr. Bussell in the reconsideration hearing. Mr. Albritton asked that it be put on record and inform the Board members he has business and personal ties to Mr. Davis, Mr. Stallworth and Mr. Blissitte. Mr. Albritton asked if there were any objections to his representing Mr. Bussell. Board had no objections.

9:45 a.m. – **David Bussell (S applying for R)** – On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Davis the Board voted to defer for additional reports. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

10:00 a.m. – **Tina Turberville (T applying for L)** – On motion by Mr. Blissitte and second by Mr. Odom the Board voted to approve Mrs. Turberville to sit for the Licensed Real Property Appraiser exam. With Mr. Davis recusing, motion carried.

10:30 a.m. – **Chris Chatham (Recip.)(TN)(Applying for G)** – On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Odom the Board voted to approve Mr. Chatham's reciprocal license. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

6.2 **AB-99-27, AB-00-77, AB-03-88, AB-04-38, AB-05-15:** On September 23, 2005 the Board issued a private reprimand to a Certified General Real Property Appraiser. Licensee is also required to pay a \$1,500 administrative fine, immediately reduce the number of trainee appraisers supervised to two and agreed to be fully compliant with the new Mentor/Trainee rules. Violations in all four cases are failure to directly supervise Trainee appraisers in violation of **§34-27A-11(3), Code of Alabama, 1975**. Case No. AB-05-15 was dismissed.

**AB-05-02:** On September 23, 2005 the Board issued a private reprimand to a Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser. Licensee is also required to pay an \$850 administrative fine and complete a 21-hour manufactured housing appraisal course and a

7-hour URAR course. Violations are as follows: Licensee reported an appraisal of a manufactured home “as is” prior to the home being moved to the property. The report should have been subject to installation, which would meet the requirement to make the home real property instead of personal property. The photograph of the subject used in the report made it appear that the home was situated on the property. Licensee did not respond to the Board’s request for the appraisal report and his work file in a timely manner. **1-1(a), 1-1(c), 1-2(h), 2-1(a), 2-1(b), 2-1(c), 2-2(b)(viii), USPAP, 2002 Ed., §34-27A-20(a)(15), Code of Alabama, 1975.**

**AB-05-03:** On September 23, 2005, the Board issued a private reprimand to a Trainee Real Estate Appraiser. Licensee is also required to pay an \$850 administrative fine and complete a 21-hour manufactured housing appraisal course and a 7-hour URAR course. Violations are as follows: Licensee reported an appraisal of a manufactured home “as is” prior to the home being moved to the property. The report should have been subject to installation, which would meet the requirement to make the home real property instead of personal property. The photograph of the subject used in the report made it appear that the home was situated on the property. Licensee did not respond to the Board’s request for the appraisal report and his work file in a timely manner. **1-1(a), 1-1(c), 1-2(h), 2-1(a), 2-1(b), 2-1(c), 2-2(b)(viii), USPAP, 2002 Ed., §34-27A-20(a)(15), Code of Alabama, 1975.**

**AB-05-45:** On September 23, 2005, the Board issued a public reprimand to Certified Residential Real Estate Appraiser **Edgar Ash (R00521)**. Licensee is also required to pay a \$500 administrative fine. Licensee appraised a conservation easement where the transaction value was \$482,000, which required a Certified General license. **§34-27A-3(a)(2), Code of Alabama, 1975.**

A **Letter of Warning** was issued on the following investigation for the discrepancies indicated. This disciplinary action will be considered in any future discipline proceedings:

**AB-05-70:** On November 10, 2005 to a Certified Residential Real Property Appraiser for a residential appraisal where the basement area and a workshop were omitted from the appraisal and where appraiser failed to disclose the significant real property assistance of another appraiser who developed and prepared the report for Licensee’s signature. **Violation: 1-1(a); 1-1(c); 2-1(a); 2-1(b), 2-3; USPAP, 2001 Ed.**

Ms. Conway discussed with the Board the investigative status charts. Ms. Conway informed the Board since last meeting the Board received 32 new complaints, 15 complaints were dismissed and 15 were settled with a total of 129 open complaints. The Board discussed the fact that we are down to only one investigator at this time.

Mr. Dixon included Investigation Division Reports that he compiled for Board information.

6.2.1 The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-50**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mr. Stallworth, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Report **AB-05-61**: On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mr. Stallworth, the Board voted that Probable Cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. With Mr. Davis recusing motion carried.

The Board reviewed Probable Cause Summary **AB-05-65**: On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Blissitte, the Board voted that probable cause does exist and to proceed with a formal investigation. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

6.2.2 The Board reviewed anonymous complaint **AB-05-157 (Supervisor)** and **AB-05-158 (Trainee)**. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to initiate formal complaints. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed anonymous complaint **AB-05-159 (Supervisor)** and **AB-05-160 (Trainee)**. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Martin the Board voted to initiate formal complaints. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed anonymous complaint **AB-05-177 (Supervisor)** and **AB-05-178 (Trainee)**. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to initiate formal complaints. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

6.2.3 The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Orders on **AB-03-53, AB-03-96, AB-04-80**. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to approve these Consent Settlement Orders as presented. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Order on **AB-04-25**. On motion by Mr. Martin and second by Mr. Blissitte the Board voted to approve this Consent Settlement Order as presented. With Mr. Davis recusing motion carried by unanimous vote.

The Board reviewed Consent Settlement Orders on **AB-04-28, AB-04-29, AB-04-68**. On motion by Mr. Blissitte and second by Mr. Stallworth the Board voted to approve these Consent Settlement Orders as presented. With Mr. Davis recusing motion carried by unanimous vote.

- 6.3 No reciprocal agreements to report since last meeting.
- 6.4 The following reciprocal licenses were issued since last meeting: Rita Baileys (R)(GA), Andre E. Brown (L)(GA), Samuel L. Craft (R)(MS), Richard D. Hyatt (R)(TN), Edward P. Karabedian (G)(GA), Joseph S. Key (G)(TN), Peter A. Lams (G)(GA), Chris Lantz (G)(TX), Charles A. Raymer (R)(GA), Rudolph R. Robinson, III (G)(TX), Robert W. White (G)(VA), James B. Wood (L)(GA).
- 7.0 The temporary permit report was provided to the Board for their information.
- 8.0 At this time, the Board held annual nominations for the Chairman and Vice-Chairman positions. Mrs. Brooks opened nominations for the Chairman position. Mr. Garrett made a nomination to elect Mr. Davis as chairman. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Garrett the nominations were closed. With Mr. Davis abstaining motion carried. On motion by Garrett and second by Mr. Stallworth, the Board voted Mr. Davis Chairman of the Board. With Mr. Davis abstaining motion carried.

Mrs. Brooks opened nominations for the Vice-Chairman position. Mr. Garrett made a nomination to elect Mr. Blissitte as Vice-Chairman. On motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Garrett the nominations were closed. With Mr. Blissitte abstaining motion carried. On motion by Mr. Garrett and second by Mr. Stallworth, the Board voted Mr. Blissitte as Vice-Chairman of the Board. With Mr. Blissitte abstaining motion carried.

The Board took this time to thank Mr. Dixon for all his hard work.

Mrs. Brooks informed the Board that Personnel was still analyzing the Investigator position and hopefully would have something to report at the January meeting.



9.0 At 1:10 p.m. on motion by Mr. Stallworth and second by Mr. Garrett the Board voted to adjourn. Motion carried by unanimous vote.

Sincerely,

Carolyn Greene  
Executive Secretary

CG

**APPROVED:** \_\_\_\_\_  
**Mandell Tillman, Chairman**